

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

ELIZABETH CHAN, TAMARA HOFFMAN,
RACHEL EHRENPREIS, CHAIM KATZ,
WINNIE CHEUNG, MEIR EHRENPREIS,
JOHN BAILEY, SEAN CARNEY, LUIS DIAZ
AND FAMILIES FOR A BETTER PLAN FOR
CONGESTION,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION, FEDERAL HIGHWAY
ADMINISTRATION, THE METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, THE
TRIBOROUGH BRIDGE AND TUNNEL
AUTHORITY, SHAILEN BHATT, in his
official capacity as Administrator of the Federal
Highway Administration, RICHARD J.
MARQUIS, in his official capacity as Division
Administrator of the New York Division of the
Federal Highway Administration, NICHOLAS
A. CHOUBAH, P.E. in his official capacity as
Chief Engineer for the New York State
Department of Transportation, WILLIAM J.
CARRY in his official capacity as Assistant
Commissioner for Policy for the New York
City Department of Transportation,

Defendants.

Hon. Lewis J. Liman

Civ. No. 23-cv-10365-LJL

**NOTICE OF CROSS MOTION FOR
SUMMARY JUDGMENT BY THE
METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
AUTHORITY, THE TRIBOROUGH
BRIDGE AND TUNNEL AUTHORITY,
AND THE NEW YORK CITY
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION**

ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that upon (1) the accompanying Memorandum of Law in Support of the Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment and Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment and (2) the Administrative Record, Defendants the Metropolitan Transportation Authority, the Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority, and the New York City Department of Transportation hereby move this Court for an order granting summary judgment pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56.

Dated: April 1, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX
Corporation counsel of the City of New York
By: /s/ Nathan Taylor
Nathan Taylor
Senior Counsel
Environmental Law Division
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356-2315
ntaylor@law.nyc.gov

*Counsel for Defendant the New York City
Department of Transportation*

/s/ Mark A. Chertok
Mark A. Chertok
Elizabeth Knauer
John F. Nelson
Amy Cassidy
SIVE, PAGET & RIESEL, P.C.
560 Lexington Avenue, 15th Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212) 421-2150
mchertok@sprlaw.com
eknauer@sprlaw.com
jnelson@sprlaw.com
acassidy@sprlaw.com

/s/ Roberta A. Kaplan
Roberta A. Kaplan
Gabrielle E. Tenzer
KAPLAN HECKER & FINK LLP
350 Fifth Avenue, 63rd Floor
New York, NY 10118
rkaplan@kaplanhecker.com
gtenzer@kaplanhecker.com

Joshua A. Matz
Kate Harris (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)
KAPLAN HECKER & FINK LLP
1050 K Street NW, Suite 1040
Washington, DC 20001
jmatz@kaplanhecker.com
kharris@kaplanhecker.com

*Counsel for Defendants the Metropolitan
Transportation Authority and the
Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority*